Diversification of complex butterfly wing patterns by repeated regulatory evolution of a *Wnt* ligand

Arnaud Martin^{a,b,1}, Riccardo Papa^{a,c}, Nicola J. Nadeau^d, Ryan I. Hill^{e,2}, Brian A. Counterman^f, Georg Halder^g, Chris D. Jiggins^{b,d}, Marcus R. Kronforst^{e,3}, Anthony D. Long^a, W. Owen McMillan^{b,4}, and Robert D. Reed^{a,b,4,5}

^aDepartment of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Irvine, CA 92697; ^bSmithsonian Tropical Research Institute, Apartado Postal 2072, Balboa, Panama; ^cDepartment of Biology, Center for Applied Tropical Ecology and Conservation, University of Puerto Rico, Rio Piedras, Puerto Rico 00931; ^dDepartment of Zoology, University of Cambridge, Cambridge CB2 3EJ, United Kingdom; ^eFAS Center for Systems Biology, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA 02138; ^fDepartment of Biological Sciences, Missispipi State University, Mississippi State, MS 39762; and ^gDepartment of Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, M. D. Anderson Cancer Center, University of Texas, Houston, TX 77030

Edited by Sean B. Carroll, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI, and approved June 25, 2012 (received for review March 20, 2012)

Although animals display a rich variety of shapes and patterns, the genetic changes that explain how complex forms arise are still unclear. Here we take advantage of the extensive diversity of *Heliconius* butterflies to identify a gene that causes adaptive variation of black wing patterns within and between species. Linkage mapping in two species groups, gene-expression analysis in seven species, and pharmacological treatments all indicate that *cis*-regulatory evolution of the *WntA* ligand underpins discrete changes in color pattern features across the *Heliconius* genus. These results illustrate how the direct modulation of morphogen sources can generate a wide array of unique morphologies, thus providing a link between natural genetic variation, pattern formation, and adaptation.

Müllerian mimicry | Wnt pathway | Mendelian genetics | evolutionary-developmental biology

ell fate induction by signaling molecules is a central characteristic of developmental pattern formation (1, 2), thus the evolution of genes encoding signaling molecules is expected to drive pattern evolution and contribute to morphological diversity (3, 4). An empirical test of this hypothesis relies on linking molecular and phenotypic evolution using forward genetic approaches (5-7), and indeed a handful of signaling gene variants underlying morphological differences in natural populations have been identified (8-14). Here we show that genetic variation linked to a Wnt-family signaling molecule drives the diversification of complex wing patterns in Heliconius erato and Heliconius melpomene mimetic butterflies (15). These species are unpalatable and each has undergone parallel adaptive radiations, such that the geographic range of each species is composed of a nearly identical patchwork of distinct geographic races (16, 17). Local populations of coexisting butterflies share common wing patterns that provide mutualistic protection (Müllerian mimicry) from avian predators (18, 19). With their extensive within-species variation (16, 20) and numerous cases of mimetic convergence between species, Heliconius wing patterns form an ideal model to study the repeatability of complex trait evolution (7, 15, 21-24).

Results

Wing Pattern Shape Variation Repeatedly Maps to WntA. The great diversity in forewing band shape across the *H. erato* wing color pattern radiation is controlled by a single locus of large effect called *Short band* (*Sd*) (15, 22, 25). Pattern variation occurs through changes in the size and position of black pattern elements, which in turn define the shape of yellow and white areas of the forewing (Fig. 1*A* and *SI Appendix*, Fig. S1). We positionally cloned this locus using a combination of restriction-associated amplified DNA (RAD) markers (26) and traditional linkage mapping. Our RAD screen of a *H. erato notabilis* × *Heliconius himera* F2 brood pinpointed a single scaffold from the *H. melpomene* genome (27) that showed an enrichment of *Sd*-associated SNPs (*SI Appendix*, Table S1). Further fine-scale

linkage mapping identified a 69-kb zero-recombinant interval centered on the gene encoding the signaling ligand WntA (Fig. 1B and SI Appendix, Tables S2–S4). Indeed, there was no recombination between black pattern phenotypes and WntA across 458 F2 offspring from crosses between H. himera and three different morphs of H. erato. Thus, natural Sd allelic variation controls at least four distinct pattern shape variants in H. erato (as shown in Fig. 1A). Furthermore, we found perfect linkage with a 1.1-cM resolution [~200 kb (28)] between WntA and the Anterior cell spot (Ac) locus that controls variation of forewing pattern shape in the H. melpomene/Heliconius cydno clade (15, 22, 29). Pattern variation thus has a monogenic basis in two independent radiations, re-emphasizing that repeated evolution of butterfly color pattern mimicry is driven by a relatively small toolkit of large-effect loci (15, 21, 22, 24).

WntA Expression Is Variable and Marks Presumptive Black Patterns. WntA is a member of the Wnt-family of signaling ligands (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S3), of which Wingless has previously been identified as a morphogen involved in *Drosophila* and lepidopteran wing pattern formation (30, 31). Genetic support for *WntA* as the source of adaptive variation in *Heliconius* wing patterns was corroborated by expression studies. *WntA* mRNA expression prefigured black patterns in a total of seven *Heliconius* species examined (Fig. 24). For example, *WntA* distribution varied between the *Sd*-informative *H. erato* and *H. himera* morphs, correlating with the position of black color in the central portion of the wing; *WntA* expression also showed convergence between the comimics *H. erato notabilis* and *H. melpomene plesseni* by prefiguring the black stripe dividing their forewing color patches. It is noteworthy that this median split is also visible in the

Author contributions: A.M., G.H., C.D.J., M.R.K., W.O.M., and R.D.R. designed research; A.M., R.P., N.J.N., R.I.H., and B.A.C. performed research; A.D.L. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; A.M., R.P., N.J.N., R.I.H., B.A.C., and A.D.L. analyzed data; and A.M. and R.D.R. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission

Data deposition: The RAD-mapping raw reads were deposited in the Short Read Archive (accession no. SRA045716.2); cDNA sequences were deposited in the GenBank database (accession nos. JN944582–JN944589); and genomic sequences can be accessed on the GenBank database (accession nos. HE668478 and HE669520) and on the Heliconius Genome Database, www.butterflygenome.org (scf180001243157 and scf7180001246452).

¹To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: heliconiuswing@gmail.com.

²Present address: Department of Biological Sciences, University of the Pacific, Stockton, CA 95211.

³Present address: Department of Ecology and Evolution, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL 60637.

⁴W.O.M. and R.D.R. contributed equally to this work.

⁵Present address: Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY 14853.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10. 1073/pnas.1204800109/-/DCSupplemental.



Fig. 1. Linkage mapping of forewing pattern shape variation to *WntA*. (A) Examples of forewing pattern shapes found in *Heliconius* shown with their associated *Sd* and *Ac* genotypes. Mapped *Ac* polymorphisms in the *H. melpomene/H. cydno* clade consist of presence or absence of a proximal melanic patch (arrows). (*B*) Linkage-mapping of *Sd* and *Ac*. Crossing-over events between genetic variation and individual phenotypes out of *N* individuals are featured at each marker. The depicted region spans the halves of two scaffolds separated by an assembly gap; however, the reference *H. melpomene* genetic map (27) and the colinearity of the *Impact-Dpr1* syntenic block with the silkworm genome assembly (46) provide independent evidence of contiguity between these two scaffolds (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S2).

complementary pattern of *optix* expression that marks the *H. melpomene plesseni* red/white patterns at later stages (24) (Fig. 2B). The spatial association of *WntA* expression with intraspecific color pattern variation, combined with the genetic mapping data, strongly argues that *WntA cis*-regulatory evolution is driving wing pattern variation (6). Consistent with this conclusion, we observed no coding variation within the *H. melpomene/H. cydno* clade or between parapatric races of *H. erato* with divergent forewing band shapes (*SI Appendix*, Table S5).

Heparin-Sensitive Signal Determines Pattern Boundaries. Our results imply that WntA controls pattern formation and variation, suggesting that modulating WntA protein distribution should result in pattern alterations. To test this prediction, we injected heparin into early pupae of a variety of Heliconius morphs. Heparin is an analog of heparan sulfate proteoglycans, a class of extracellular matrix compounds that play a key role in morphogen gradient formation (32). In particular, heparin-like chains bind Wntfamily ligands and promote their mobility in epithelial tissues, resulting in the expansion of their extracellular gradients (32-41). There is precedent for this effect in the butterfly Junonia coenia, where heparin injections resulted in specific expansions of the wing patterns associated with wingless expression (30, 42). We found that heparin injections had dose-dependent effects on WntA-associated Heliconius patterns (Fig. 2C and SI Appendix, Fig. S4). High dosages resulted in complete melanization of the central wing, and intermediate dosages caused partial expansion of WntA-associated black patterns with fields of peppered scales along expanding pattern boundaries. We thus conclude that an extracellular heparin-sensitive signal determines scale cell fate in a concentration-dependent manner. By themselves, these pharmacological results might be explained by possible heparin effects on a number of ligands (32); it is therefore important to note that heparin injections produced phenocopies of *WntA*-heterozygous phenotypes observed in *H. erato* and *H. cydno* hybrids (Fig. 2D). *WntA* heterozygosity is predicted to spread WntA distribution by driving its expression in adjacent domains, and similarly, heparin injections are expected to promote Wnt-ligand spread (32–41). The comparable outcomes of heparin injections and *WntA* heterozygosity thus suggest that heparin-induced pattern expansions are largely mediated by WntA (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S5).

Discussion

In this study we provide phylogenetically replicated genetic, expression, and pharmacological data that implicate *WntA* in pattern induction and adaptive evolution of black wing patterns in *Heliconius* butterflies (Fig. 3). It is worth noting the caveat, however, that the strongest support for the role of a specific gene in a developmental process is targeted loss- or gain-of-function work, which we lack because of technical limitations of our study system. This said, our heparin injection results were entirely consistent with the expectations of a targeted Wnt gain-of-function experiment (32–41). Heparin may interact with secreted molecules other than WntA, but it is too large to cross cell membranes and none of the *WntA*-neighboring genes encode extracellular products that could interact with heparin to explain its effects (*SI Appendix*, Table S4). Thus, although we are unable



Fig. 2. Variable expression of *WntA* explains pattern shape diversity in *Heliconius*. (*A*) Larval wing disk in situ hybridizations showing *WntA* expression in presumptive black territories, and delineating pattern boundaries. Vein landmarks define homologous positions between larval and adult wings. In the intermediate panels, dashed lines corresponding to the presumptive position of the light-color patterns (hashed on adult wings) were added to facilitate the comparison of larval and adult wing topologies. (*B*) *WntA* marks presumptive *optix*-negative territories in *H. melpomene plesseni*. Expression of *optix* was reproduced from ref. 24. (C) Heparin injections result in dose-dependent expansions of black patterns that phenocopy the effects of *WntA* heterozygosity (*D*, dashed lines). The absence of effect on basal iridescent (*H. sara sara*) and red (*H. erato erato* and *H. erato lativitta*) patterns rules out a generic effect of heparin on wing scale phenotypes. *H. erato lativitta* resembles *H. erato etylus* (used in mapping crosses) and both originate from Eastern Ecuador low-lands.



Pattern induction

Fig. 3. Summary of phylogenetic replication for linkage mapping of forewing pattern variation (*Sd* and *Ac* loci), *WntA in situ* hybridizations, and heparin injections presented in this study. Multiple lines of evidence suggest that forewing pattern shapes are adaptive across the genus (16, 36, 45, 49–53). NA, not applicable; NPC, narrow phenotypic cline; MüMi: Müllerian mimicry; —, not assessed because of stock limitations or unavailability. Note that *H. erato lativitta/ H. melpomene malleti*, and *H. erato notabilis/H. melpomene plesseni* are convergent comimics that occur in Eastern Ecuador low- and highlands, respectively (dashed lines). Phylogenetic relationships between species are derived from a recent molecular phylogeny (47) after retaining nodes with bootstrap support 20.98. Estimated age of *Heliconius* radiation is derived from a recent molecular clock study (48). Only a subset of *Heliconius* wing pattern diversity is represented here.

to formally rule out wing patterning functions for genes genetically linked to *WntA*, all results positively indicate that *cis*-regulatory variation at *WntA* is sufficient to explain the natural wing pattern variation considered in this study.

This first discovery of a Wnt-pathway gene driving variation in natural populations complements developmental evolution studies [e.g., the previous reports of wing color patterning by *wingless* (30, 31)] with one important difference: we show that genetic changes at a *Wnt* locus itself are responsible for pattern variation. *WntA* is deployed early during wing development and may determine pattern boundaries and identities rather than acting directly as a melanic activator, as suggested by its complementarity with pattern-specific *optix* expression at later stages (Fig. 2B). As such, linking a patterning molecule to the evolution of a protean, highly variable trait fills an empirical gap between the genetics of adaptive change (6, 43) and the developmental pathways that generate complex phenotypic diversity (3, 4). Because of its repeated association with mimetic phenotypes in two independent color pattern radiations, *cis*-regulatory changes of *WntA* expression also appear to represent a path of least resistance in evolution of novel wing patterns. Spatial shifts of morphogen sources may thus be a key mechanism for generating phenotypic novelty through quantum leaps across the landscape of possible morphologies.

Methods

Mapping Crosses. The *H. himera* × *H. erato* and *H. melpomene malleti* × *H. melpomene melpomene* families are described elsewhere (25, 28, 44). Segregation of the recessive *ac* allele in the *H. melpomene* cross is only visible if a yellow color of the forewing band is inherited from *H. melpomene malleti*, because of epistasis of *Ac* with the *N* locus (28, 29). Therefore, [*ac/ac*] vs. [*Ac/*–] segregating phenotypes were scored based on the presence vs. absence of a yellow "hourglass" pattern in the discal cell, respectively, and nonyellow banded individuals were not included in the analysis. The *H. cydno galanthus* (*ac/ac*) × *H. pachinus* (*Ac/Ac*) (four male-informative back-cross) families are described elsewhere (22, 45).

RAD Mapping. Preparation of a RAD sequencing library followed the canonical protocol (26) with adaptations to a bulked segregant analysis design. In brief, genomic DNA from 25 Sd^{not/not} and 25 Sd^{him/him} F2 individuals from a single *H. himera* × *H. erato notabilis* family were combined equimolarly (50 ng per individual) into two separate Sd^{not/not} and Sd^{him/him} DNA pools. Each pool was digested with the restriction enzyme Ncol, ligated to barcoded adapters, and sequenced on a single lane of an Illumina Genome Analyzer GAII generating 72-bp paired-end reads. The resulting reads were sorted by barcode and aligned to the reference assembly of the *H. melpomene* genome. A custom script was used to generate a table of 46,236 SNPs that each mapped to a *H. melpomene* scaffold with a median coverage of 86x. Library preparation and data analysis details are included in *SI Appendix, SI Methods*.

Individual Genotyping. The *H. melpomene* reference scaffold *scf7180001243157* was referenced for linkage mapping of the *Sd* and *Ac* traits. PCR primers and genotyping methods are detailed in *SI Appendix*, Table S2.

- 1. Wolpert L (1969) Positional information and the spatial pattern of cellular differentiation. J Theor Biol 25:1–47.
- Salazar-Ciudad I, Jernvall J, Newman SA (2003) Mechanisms of pattern formation in development and evolution. *Development* 130:2027–2037.
- Carroll SB, Grenier JK, Weatherbee SD (2004) From DNA to Diversity: Molecular Genetics and the Evolution of Animal Design, Second Edition (Blackwell Scientific, Malden, MA).
- Wilkins AS (2002) The Evolution of Developmental Pathways (Sinauer Associates, Sunderland).
- Stern DL (2000) Evolutionary developmental biology and the problem of variation. Evolution 54:1079–1091.
- Stern DL, Orgogozo V (2008) The loci of evolution: How predictable is genetic evolution? Evolution 62:2155–2177.
- 7. Kopp A (2009) Metamodels and phylogenetic replication: A systematic approach to the evolution of developmental pathways. *Evolution* 63:2771–2789.
- Albertson RC, Streelman JT, Kocher TD, Yelick PC (2005) Integration and evolution of the cichlid mandible: The molecular basis of alternate feeding strategies. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 102:16287–16292.
- Bonilla C, et al. (2005) The 8818G allele of the agouti signaling protein (ASIP) gene is ancestral and is associated with darker skin color in African Americans. *Hum Genet* 116:402–406.
- Manceau M, Domingues VS, Mallarino R, Hoekstra HE (2011) The developmental role of Agouti in color pattern evolution. *Science* 331:1062–1065.
- Anderson TM, et al. (2009) Molecular and evolutionary history of melanism in North American gray wolves. Science 323:1339–1343.
- 12. Colosimo PF, et al. (2005) Widespread parallel evolution in sticklebacks by repeated fixation of Ectodysplasin alleles. *Science* 307:1928–1933.
- Miller CT, et al. (2007) cis-Regulatory changes in Kit ligand expression and parallel evolution of pigmentation in sticklebacks and humans. Cell 131:1179–1189.
- Loehlin DW, Werren JH (2012) Evolution of shape by multiple regulatory changes to a growth gene. Science 335:943–947.
- Papa R, Martin A, Reed RD (2008) Genomic hotspots of adaptation in butterfly wing pattern evolution. Curr Opin Genet Dev 18:559–564.
- Brown KS, Jr (1979) Eco-geography and evolution in neotropical forests. PhD thesis (Universidade Estadual de Campinas, Brazil).
- Hines HM, et al. (2011) Wing patterning gene redefines the mimetic history of *Heliconius* butterflies. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 108:19666–19671.
- Kapan DD (2001) Three-butterfly system provides a field test of Müllerian mimicry. Nature 409:338–340.
- Langham GM (2004) Specialized avian predators repeatedly attack novel color morphs of *Heliconius* butterflies. *Evolution* 58:2783–2787.
- Gilbert LE (2003) in Ecology and Evolution Taking Flight: Butterflies as Model Systems, eds Boggs CL, Watt WB, Ehrlich PR (Univ of Chicago Press, Chicago, IL), pp. 281–318.
 Joron M, et al. (2006) A conserved supergene locus controls colour pattern diversity in
- Heliconius butterflies. PLoS Biol 4:e303. 22. Kronforst MR, Kapan DD, Gilbert LE (2006) Parallel genetic architecture of parallel
- adaptive radiations in mimetic *Heliconius* butterflies. *Genetics* 174:535–539.

Animals, Gene Cloning, and in Situ Hybridizations. The butterflies used for expression analysis and sequence comparison originated from phenotypically pure stocks (i.e., homozygous for wing pattern alleles) maintained in the outdoor insectaries at the *Heliconius* Stock and Rearing Center at the Smithsonian Tropical Research Institute in Gamboa, Panama. Isolation of *WntA* cDNA and in situ hybridization was performed as previously described (24), and primer sequences and minor modifications are included in *SI Appendix, SI Methods*.

Heparin Injections. Heparin sodium salt (Sigma-Aldrich) was dissolved in sterile H₂O at a concentration of 5 μ g/µL, aliquoted, and kept frozen. Pupae aged 12–16 h after pupation were injected with 5 μ g/µL heparin or sterile H₂O using a pulled glass micropipette mounted on a 10-µL cut pipette tip and a 2- to 20-µL pipette. Pupae were surface-sterilized with ethanol and injected on the left side in an interstice that separates the baso-posterior parts of the developing forewing and hindwing. As in a previous report (42), H₂O controls showed no effects, heparin had systemic effects on both left and right wing patterns, and control and heparin injections did not produce local damage artifacts. All of the results presented in Fig. 2*C* were replicated at least three times per morph and dosage (including H₂O control), but, because of stock limitations, the results presented in *SI Appendix*, Fig. S4 were replicated in only two individuals per morph and without H₂O control.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank D. Kapan, S. Rusza, M. Abanto, P. Etter, J. Davey, H. Hines, A. Morrison, N. Gillingham, T. Douglas, J. Olander, A. Tapia, C. Pardo-Diaz, L. Maroja, and L. Gilbert for laboratory help and breeding work; and governmental agencies from Panama, Costa Rica, Ecuador, and French Guiana for permits. This work was funded by National Science Foundation Grants DEB-0844244, DEB-1020355, and IOS-1052541; and Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council Grant BB/ H01439X/1.

- Baxter SW, et al. (2008) Convergent evolution in the genetic basis of Müllerian mimicry in *Heliconius* butterflies. *Genetics* 180:1567–1577.
- Reed RD, et al. (2011) optix drives the repeated convergent evolution of butterfly wing pattern mimicry. Science 333:1137–1141.
- Kapan DD, et al. (2006) Localization of Müllerian mimicry genes on a dense linkage map of *Heliconius erato*. Genetics 173:735–757.
- Etter PD, Bassham S, Hohenlohe PA, Johnson EA, Cresko WA (2011) Molecular Methods for Evolutionary Genetics, eds Orgogozo V, Rockman MV (Humana Press, New York, NY).
- The Heliconius Genome Consortium (2012) A butterfly genome reveals promiscuous exchange of mimicry adaptations among species. *Nature* 487:94–98.
- Jiggins CD, et al. (2005) A genetic linkage map of the mimetic butterfly Heliconius melpomene. Genetics 171:557–570.
- Naisbit RE, Jiggins CD, Mallet J (2003) Mimicry: Developmental genes that contribute to speciation. *Evol Dev* 5:269–280.
- Martin A, Reed RD (2010) Wingless and aristaless 2 define a developmental ground plan for moth and butterfly wing pattern evolution. Mol Biol Evol 27:2864–2878.
- Werner T, Koshikawa S, Williams TM, Carroll SB (2010) Generation of a novel wing colour pattern by the Wingless morphogen. Nature 464:1143–1148.
- Yan D, Lin X (2009) Shaping morphogen gradients by proteoglycans. Cold Spring Harb Perspect Biol 1:a002493.
- Bradley RS, Brown AMC (1990) The proto-oncogene int-1 encodes a secreted protein associated with the extracellular matrix. EMBO J 9:1569–1575.
- Reichsman F, Smith L, Cumberledge S (1996) Glycosaminoglycans can modulate extracellular localization of the wingless protein and promote signal transduction. J Cell Biol 135:819–827.
- 35. Binari RC, et al. (1997) Genetic evidence that heparin-like glycosaminoglycans are involved in wingless signaling. *Development* 124:2623–2632.
- Greco V, Hannus M, Eaton S (2001) Argosomes: A potential vehicle for the spread of morphogens through epithelia. Cell 106:633–645.
- Baeg GH, Lin X, Khare N, Baumgartner S, Perrimon N (2001) Heparan sulfate proteoglycans are critical for the organization of the extracellular distribution of *Wingless. Development* 128:87–94.
- 38. Hufnagel L, Kreuger J, Cohen SM, Shraiman BI (2006) On the role of glypicans in the process of morphogen gradient formation. *Dev Biol* 300:512–522.
- Colombres M, et al. (2008) Heparin activates Wnt signaling for neuronal morphogenesis. J Cell Physiol 216:805–815.
- Fuerer C, Habib SJ, Nusse R (2010) A study on the interactions between heparan sulfate proteoglycans and Wnt proteins. *Dev Dyn* 239:184–190.
- Ling L, et al. (2010) Synergism between Wnt3a and heparin enhances osteogenesis via a phosphoinositide 3-kinase/Akt/RUNX2 pathway. J Biol Chem 285:26233–26244.
- Serfas MS, Carroll SB (2005) Pharmacologic approaches to butterfly wing patterning: Sulfated polysaccharides mimic or antagonize cold shock and alter the interpretation of gradients of positional information. *Dev Biol* 287:416–424.
- Prud'homme B, Gompel N, Carroll SB (2007) Emerging principles of regulatory evolution. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104(Suppl 1):8605–8612.

- 44. Papa R, et al. (2008) Highly conserved gene order and numerous novel repetitive elements in genomic regions linked to wing pattern variation in *Heliconius* butter-flies. *BMC Genomics* 9:345.
- Chamberlain NL, Hill RI, Kapan DD, Gilbert LE, Kronforst MR (2009) Polymorphic butterfly reveals the missing link in ecological speciation. *Science* 326:847–850.
- Duan J, et al. (2010) SilkDB v2.0: A platform for silkworm (Bombyx mori) genome biology. Nucleic Acids Res 38(Database issue):D453–D456.
- Beltran M, Jiggins CD, Brower AVZ, Bermingham E, Mallet J (2007) Do pollen feeding, pupal-mating and larval gregariousness have a single origin in *Heliconius* butterflies? Inferences from multilocus DNA sequence data. *Biol J Linn Soc Lond* 92:221–239.
- Pohl N, Sison-Mangus MP, Yee EN, Liswi SW, Briscoe AD (2009) Impact of duplicate gene copies on phylogenetic analysis and divergence time estimates in butterflies. BMC Evol Biol 9:99.

DNAS

SAN A

- Jiggins CD, McMillan WO, Neukirchen W, Mallet J (1996) What can hybrid zones tell us about speciation? The case of *Heliconius erato* and *H. himera* (Lepidoptera:Nymphalidae). *Biol J Linn Soc Lond* 59:221–242.
- 50. Mallet J (1993) in *Hybrid Zones and the Evolutionary Process*, ed Harrison RG (Oxford University Press, New York, NY), pp. 226–260.
- Mallet J, Gilbert LE (1995) Why are there so many mimicry rings—Correlations between habitat, behavior and mimicry in *Heliconius* butterflies. *Biol J Linn Soc Lond* 55: 159–180.
- Mallet J, et al. (1990) Estimates of selection and gene flow from measures of cline width and linkage disequilibrium in *heliconius* hybrid zones. *Genetics* 124: 921–936.
- Kronforst MR, Young LG, Gilbert LE (2007) Reinforcement of mate preference among hybridizing *Heliconius* butterflies. J Evol Biol 20:278–285.